

# The role Ideology in Caste Structure - Sociological Study

\*Dr.Basavaraja.A.D. Asst Professor of Sociology, Govt First Grade College, Harapanahalli

## Abstract

This paper attempts to study Indian **caste** system as the unique **ideology** of exclusivist doctrine which has its distinctive features and motivations. The word caste derives from the Spanish and Portuguese “casta”, means “race, lineage, or breed”. Portuguese employed casta in the modern sense when they applied it to hereditary Indian social groups called as ‘jati’ in India. ‘Jati’ originates from the root word ‘Jana’ which implies taking birth. Thus, caste is concerned with birth.

According to Anderson and Parker, “Caste is that extreme form of social class organization in which the position of individuals in the status hierarchy is determined by **descent and birth.**” The Indian caste system is a complex social structure wherein social roles like one’s profession became ‘hereditary,’ resulting in restricted social mobility and fixed status hierarchies. Furthermore, we argue that the inherent property of caste heightens group identification with one’s caste. Highly identified group members would protect the identity of the group in situations when group norms are violated. In this paper, we were interested in examining the consequence of caste norm violation and how an individual’s status is mentally represented. High caste norms are associated with moral values while the lower caste norms are associated with immorality. We predicted a ‘black sheep effect,’ that is, when high caste individuals’ group identity (caste norm violation condition) is threatened their salient high caste identity would increase, thereby resulting in devaluing the status of their fellow in-group member if the latter is perceived as perpetrator. We presented participants with a social conflict situation of a victim and a perpetrator that is ‘*Caste norm consistent*’ (Lower caste individual as a perpetrator and higher caste individual as a victim) and vice versa ‘*Caste norm inconsistent*’ condition (higher caste individual as perpetrator and lower caste individual as a victim). Then, participants had to choose from nine pictorial depictions representing the protagonists in the story on a vertical line, with varying degrees of status distance. Results showed evidence for the black sheep effect and, furthermore, revealed that no other identity (religious, national, and regional) resulted in devaluing the status of fellow in-group member. These results help us understand the ‘black sheep’ effect in the context of moral norms and status representation and are discussed in the framework of the Indian society.

**Key words:** *caste identity, norm-violation, social identity threat, status, ideology*

## Introduction

Ever since their launch in the USA in 1993, Exchange Traded Funds or ETFs have grown in popularity around the globe. In India, ETFs were launched in 2002 by Benchmark Mutual Fund. The first ETF to be launched in India was Nifty BeES (*Nifty Benchmark Exchange-Traded Scheme*). While most investors are aware of stocks and mutual funds, there is a lot of ambiguity when it comes to understanding ETFs. Today, we will be offering a beginner's guide to investing in ETFs. Herding on the New York Stock Exchange (NYSE). We measure the degree of herding from 1998-2001, the "bubble" period and its collapse. We find a weak negative relationship between dispersion of opinion among investors and herding measures. A noteworthy aspect of the analysis is that the data is analyzed using two different herding tests, and the results of the tests are compared using the Cochran-Mantel-Haenszel test for repeated tests of independence. The Indian investment market has undergone a sea change over the last three decades. Investors have confidently moved from the traditional investment instruments like bank fixed deposits, shares, and mutual funds to the more evolved options like derivatives, commodities, and exchange traded funds or ETFs. In this article, we will talk about ETFs and look at their evolutionary path while trying to assess where the ETF market is headed in India.

An Exchange Traded Fund(ETF) is a portfolio of securities that can be traded on a stock exchange. Hence, with an ETF, reap the benefits of a diversified portfolio (like in mutual funds) while enjoying the liquidity of being traded on a stock exchange (like stocks).

Globally, the rationale behind launching ETFs has been the same – open-ended mutual funds fail to provide the flexibility of intra-day redemptions and close-ended mutual funds trade either at high discounts or premiums. Hence, the market needed an exchange-traded investment instrument that is traded throughout the day. Also, the market value of such an instrument needed to be as close to the value of the underlying asset(s). Benchmark Mutual Fund continued to be the pioneer of [ETFs in India](#) and launched the first debt exchange-traded fund in 2004 called Liquid BeEs. This was a Fixed Income ETF. In fact, it was the first money market ETF that gave India the privilege of being the first country to launch an ETF catering to the needs of risk-averse investors.

Subsequently, in 2007, the fund house launched the first gold exchange-traded fund called Gold BeEs. While Goldman Sachs bought Benchmark Mutual Fund in 2011 and Reliance Mutual Fund bought Goldman Sachs in 2014, these ETFs are still operational. As of November 2014, there were 71 ETFs that track various debt and equity indices with total assets under management of around INR 1.47 trillion.

By the time the world recovered from the financial crisis of 2008, the Indian ETF market was experiencing a shift towards gold. In fact, from 2009 to 2014, around 50 percent of the total assets in various ETFs were in Gold funds.

2014-15 was an interesting year in the Indian investment market's landscape. People were confident about the growth of the Indian economy based on some strong fundamentals that led to optimistic investments. Also, in 2014, the Government of India decided to disinvest a part of its holdings in Public Sector Units via ETFs. This led to the launch of the CPSE ETF (Central Public Sector Enterprise Exchange Traded Fund) in March 2014. This was a huge success with the government harvesting around INR 3000 crores via the disinvestment. The latest ETF to join the league is the Bharat Bond ETF, launched in December of last year.

## **Objective:**

This paper intends to explore and analyze **Ideological** basis of the **Indian caste system** related to its hierarchy, its history, and its effects on India today.

### **Traditional Theoretical setting of the Caste System**

According to this theory, the caste system is of divine origin. It says caste system is an extension of the varna system, where the 4 varnas originated from the body of Bramha.

At the top of the hierarchy were the Brahmins who were mainly teachers and intellectuals and came from Brahma's head. Kshatriyas, or the warriors and rulers, came from his arms. Vaishyas, or the traders, were created from his thighs. At the bottom were the Shudras, who came from Brahma's feet. The mouth signifies its use for preaching, learning etc, the arms – protections, thighs – to cultivate or business, feet – helps the whole body, so the duty of the Shudras is to serve all the others. The sub castes emerged later due to inter marriages between the 4 varnas.

The proponents of this theory cite Purushasukta of Rigveda, Manusmriti etc to support their stand.

**Note:** It is from the post Vedic period, the old distinction of Arya and Sudra appears as Dvija and Sudra, The first three classes are called Dvija (twice born) because they have to go through the initiation ceremony which is symbolic of rebirth. “The Sudra was called “ekajati” (once born).

**Note:** Caste system developed on rigid lines post Mauryan period, especially after the establishment of Sunga dynasty by Pushyamitra Sunga (184 BC). This dynasty was an ardent patron of ‘Brahminism’. Through Manusmriti, Brahmins once again succeeded in organizing the supremacy and imposed severe restrictions on the Sudras. Manusmriti mentioned that, ‘the Sudra, who insults a twice born man, shall have his tongue cut out’.

**Note:** Chinese scholar Hieun Tsang, who visited India in 630 AD , writes that, “Brahminism dominated the country, caste ruled the social structure and the persons following unclean occupations like butchers, scavengers had to live outside the city”.

## Principal features of caste system ideology in India

1. **Segmental Division of Society:** The society is divided into various small social groups called castes. Each of these castes is a well developed social group, the membership of which is determined by the consideration of birth.
2. **Hierarchy:** According to Louis Dumont , castes teach us a fundamental social principle of hierarchy. At the top of this hierarchy is the Brahmin caste and at the bottom is the untouchable caste. In between are the intermediate castes, the relative positions of which are not always clear.
3. **Endogamy:** Endogamy is the chief characteristic of caste, i.e. the members of a caste or sub-caste should marry within their own caste or sub-caste. The violation of the rule of endogamy would mean ostracism and loss of caste. However, hypergamy (practice of women marrying someone who is wealthier or of higher caste or social status.) and hypogamy (marriage with a person of lower social status) were also prevalent. Gotra exogamy is also maintained in each caste. Every caste is subdivided into different small units on the basis of gotra. The members of one gotra are believed to be successors of a common ancestor-hence prohibition of marriage within the same gotra.
4. **Hereditary status and occupation:** Megasthenes, the Greek traveler to India in 300 B. C., mentions hereditary occupation as one of the two features of caste system, the other being endogamy.
5. **Restriction on Food and Drink:** Usually a caste would not accept cooked food from any other caste that stands lower than itself in the social scale, due to the notion of getting polluted. There were also various associated taboos related to food. The cooking taboo, which defines the persons who may cook the food. The eating taboo which may lay down the ritual to be followed at meals. The commensal taboo which is concerned with the person with whom one may take food. Finally, the taboo which has to do with the nature of the vessel (whether made of earth, copper or brass) that one may use for drinking or cooking. For eg: In North India Brahmin would accept pakka food (cooked in ghee) only from some castes lower than his own. However, no individual would accept kachcha(cooked in water) food prepared by an inferior caste. Food prepared by Brahmin is acceptable to all, the reason for which domination of Brahmins in hotel industry for long time. Beef was not allowed by any castes, except harijans.
6. **A Particular Name:** Every caste has a particular name through which we can identify it. Sometimes, an occupation is also associated with a particular caste.
7. **The Concept of Purity and Pollution:** The higher castes claimed to have ritual, spiritual and racial purity which they maintained by keeping the lower castes away through the notion of pollution. The idea of pollution means a touch of lower caste man would pollute or defile a man of higher caste. Even his shadow is considered enough to pollute a higher caste man.

8. **Jati Panchayat:** The status of each caste is carefully protected, not only by caste laws but also by the conventions. These are openly enforced by the community through a governing body or board called Jati Panchayat. These Panchayats in different regions and castes are named in a particular fashion such as Kuldriya in Madhya Pradesh and Jokhila in South Rajasthan.

### **Varna vs Caste – The difference**

Varna and caste are 2 different concepts, though some people wrongly consider it the same.

<b>Varna</b>	<b>Caste</b>
Literally 'Varna' means colour and originates Caste or 'Jati' originates from the root word from the word 'Vri' meaning the choice of one's 'Jana' which implies taking birth. Thus, caste is occupation. Hence Varna is concerned with one's concerned with birth.	
colour or occupation.	
Varna's are only four in number i.e. Brahmin, Castes are very large in number. Castes also have Kshatriya, Vaishya and Sudra	many subdivisions known as sub-castes.
It is an all-India phenomenon	Presence of regional variations mostly based on linguistic differences.
Mobility pattern Varna's are relatively flexible with one's talent and knowledge, compared with the castes.	It is based on rigid principles and mobility is less. It is a closed type of stratification
Varna system is free from socio-economic and political disabilities	-
Varna-class correlation is mostly positive	Caste-class correlation is not always positive, There may be variations in the placement due to economic, political and educational status of various groups.

## Functions of caste system

1. It continued the traditional social organization of India.
2. It has accommodated multiple communities by ensuring each of them a monopoly of a specific means of livelihood.
3. Provided social security and social recognition to individuals. It is the individual's caste that canalizes his choice in marriage, plays the roles of the state-club, the orphanage and the benefit society. Besides, it also provides him with health insurance benefits. It even provides for his funeral.
4. It has handed over the knowledge and skills of the hereditary occupation of a caste from one generation to another, which has helped preservation of culture and ensured productivity.
5. Caste plays a crucial role in the process of socialization by teaching individuals the culture and traditions, values and norms of their society.
6. It has also led to interdependent interaction between different castes, through jajmani relationships. Caste acted as a trade union and protected its members from the exploitation.
7. Promoted political stability, as Kshatriyas were generally protected from political competition, conflict and violence by the caste system.
8. Maintained racial purity through endogamy.
9. Specialization led to quality production of goods and thus promoted economic development. For eg: Many handicraft items of India gained international recognition due to this.

## Dysfunctions of caste system

1. The caste system is a check on economic and intellectual advancement and a great stumbling block in the way of social reforms, because it keeps economic and intellectual opportunities confined to a certain section of the population only.
2. It undermines the efficiency of labour and prevents perfect mobility of labor, capital and productive effort
3. It perpetuates exploitation of the economically weaker and socially inferior castes, especially the untouchables.
4. It has inflicted untold hardships on women through its insistence on practices like child-marriage, prohibition of widow-remarriage, seclusion of women etc.

5. It opposes real democracy by giving political monopoly to Kshatriyas in the past and acting as vote bank in the present political scenario. There are political parties which solely represent a caste. eg: BSP was formed by Kanshi Ram mainly to represent SC, ST and OBC.
6. It has stood in the way of national and collective consciousness and proved to be a disintegrating rather than an integrating factor. Caste conflicts are widely prevalent in politics, reservation in jobs and education, inter-caste marriages etc. eg: Demand for Jat reservation, agitation by Patidar community.
7. It has given scope for religious conversion. The lower caste people are getting converted into Islam and Christianity due to the tyranny of the upper castes.
8. The caste system by compelling an individual to act strictly in accordance with caste norms stands in the way of modernization, by opposing change.

### **Is caste system unique to India?**

Caste system is found in other countries like Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. Caste like systems are also found in countries like Indonesia, China, Korea, Yemen and certain countries in Africa, Europe as well.

But what distinguishes Indian caste system from the rest is the core theme of purity and pollution, which is either peripheral or negligible in other similar systems of the world. In Yemen there exists a hereditary caste, Al-Akhdam who are kept as perennial manual workers. Burakumin in Japan, originally members of outcast communities in the Japanese feudal era, includes those with occupations considered impure or tainted by death.

However, India is unique in some aspects.

1. India has had a cultural continuity that no other civilization has had. The ancient systems, religions, cultures of other civilizations have been mostly gone. In India, history is present and even the external empires mostly co-opted the system rather than changing them.
2. The caste has been merged into a modern religion, making it hard to remove.
3. India has integrated multiple systems more easily. What is known as “caste” in Portuguese/English is actually made of 3 distinct components – *jati*, *jana*, *varna*. *Jati* is an occupational identification. *Jana* is an ethnic identification. *Varna* is a philosophical identification. These have been more tightly merged over the centuries.
4. In the world’s most transformative period – of the past 3 centuries, India spent the most of it under European colonialism. Thus, India lost a lot of time in changing. Most of the changes to the system came only in 1950 when [India became a republic](#).

To summarize theoretically, caste as a cultural phenomenon (i.e., as a matter of ideology or value system) is found only in India while when it is viewed as a structural phenomenon, it is found in other societies too.

There are four sociological approaches to caste by distinguishing between the two levels of theoretical formulation, i.e., cultural and structural, and universalistic and particularistic. These four approaches are cultural-universalistic, cultural-particularistic, structural- universalistic and structural-particularistic.

- Structural-particularistic view of caste has maintained that caste system is restricted to the Indian society
- Structural-universalistic category holds that caste in India is a general phenomenon of a closed form of social stratification found across the world.
- The third position of sociologists like Ghurye who treat caste as a cultural universalistic phenomenon, maintains that caste-like cultural bases of stratification are found in most traditional societies. Caste in India, is a special form of status-based social stratification. This viewpoint, was early formulated by Max Weber.
- Cultural-particularistic view is held by Louis Dumont who holds that caste is found only in India.

### **Is caste system unique to Hinduism?**

Caste-based differences are practiced in other religions like Nepalese Buddhism, Christianity, Islam, Judaism and Sikhism. But the main difference is – caste system in Hinduism is mentioned in its scriptures while other religions adopted casteism as a part of socialization or religious conversions. In other words, caste system in Hinduism is a religious institution while it is social in others.

As a general rule, higher castes converts became higher castes in other religions while lower caste converts acquired lower caste positions.

- Islam – Some upper caste Hindus converted to Islam and became part of the governing group of Sultanates and Mughal Empire, who along with Arabs, Persians and Afghans came to be known as *Ashrafs*. Below them are the middle caste Muslims called *Ajlafs*, and the lowest status is those of the
- Christianity – In Goa, Hindu converts became Christian Bamonns while Kshatriya and Vaishya became Christian noblemen called Chardos. Those Vaishya who could not get admitted into the Chardo caste became Gauddos, and Shudras became Sudirs. Dalits who converted to Christianity became Mahars and Chamars
- Buddhism – various forms of the caste system are practiced in several Buddhist countries, mainly in Sri Lanka, Tibet, and Japan where butchers, leather and metal workers and janitors are sometimes regarded as being impure.

- Jainism – There are Jain castes wherein all the members of a particular caste are Jains. At the same time there have been Jain divisions of several Hindu castes.
- Sikhism – Sikh literature mention *Varna* as *Varan*, and *Jati* as *Zat*. Eleanor Nesbitt, a professor of Religion, states that the *Varan* is described as a class system, while *Zat* has some caste system features in Sikh literature. All Gurus of Sikhs married within their *Zat*, and they did not condemn or break with the convention of endogamous marriages.

### **Caste Divisions – The future?**

Caste system in India is undergoing changes due to progress in education, technology, modernization and changes in general social outlook. In spite of general improvement in conditions of the lower castes, India has still a long way to go, to root out the evils of the caste system from the society. People in general belong to many social categories that could either be achieved, such as one's profession, or inherited, such as one's gender. The consequences of social categorizations are often not only seen in the dynamics of social interactions, but also in the way social status is represented. For the present research, the Indian/Hindu caste system is of interest, which is an integral feature of the Indian societal structure. The caste system provides a hierarchy of social roles that hold inherent characteristics and, more importantly, remain stable throughout life. An implicit status is attached to one's caste which historically changed from the social roles to hereditary roles. This, created status hierarchies on hereditary basis with limited social mobility.

### **Conclusion**

Considering the complexity of the Indian caste system, it was crucial to look into a small consequence of the caste system rather than the whole structure on its own. Even now, people in India continue to define their self-identity by means of the caste they belong to and the social group that they find themselves in. Caste membership is thus ingrained in the society and there is considerable reason to claim that caste as a type of social identity would probably be one of the most salient identities in the Indian context. This aspect is addressed by Social Identity Theory. This study also paves the way into the understanding of the black sheep effect as seen in status representation as supposed to general in-group derogation attitudes. It is fundamental to expand this study by examining other aspects of social identity threat in the Indian context, such as religion, to gain some more understanding of how multiple identities interact with each other in the functioning of the Indian society.

## References

1. Diateill, Erwan. 2012. "Cultural Anthropology or Social Anthropology? A Transatlantic Dispute." *L'Année sociologique* 62(2012/1):93-122.
2. QAA. 2007. Anthropology. Mansfield, UK: Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education. Archived from the original 21 September 2013. ISBN 978-1-84482-778-7.
3. "Sociology and Its Relationships to Other Social Sciences" (PDF). National Organisation of Sociology. Archived from the original (PDF) on 26 June 2011.
4. Kirst-Ashman, K.K.; Hull, G H. (2009). Generalist Practice with Organisations and Communities (4th ed.). Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole Cengage Learning. ISBN 978-0-495-50715-4.
5. Hepworth, D.H, Rooney, R.H., Rooney, G.D, Strom-Gottfried, K., Larsen, J.A. (2006). "1". Direct Social Work Practice. Belmont, CA: Thomson Brooks/Cole. ISBN 978-0-534-64458-1.
6. Janes, Craig Robert; Stall, Ron; Gifford, Sandra M (1986). James Trostle. Springer. ISBN 978-90-277-2248-5. Retrieved 8 September 2009.
7. Horowitz, Irving (1994) The Decomposition of Sociology Oxford University Press. pp. 3–9
8. Collins, Randall as cited in Horowitz, Irving. 1994. The Decomposition of Sociology. Oxford University Press. pp. 3–9.
9. "The most cited authors of books in the humanities". timeshighereducation.co.uk. 26 March 2009. Retrieved 16 November 2009.
10. "2011 Journal Citation Reports". Web of Science (Social Sciences ed.). Thomson Reuters. 2011. Missing or empty |url= (help)
11. Aby, Stephen H. 2005. Sociology: A Guide to Reference and Information Sources (3rd ed.). Littleton, CO: Libraries Unlimited Inc. ISBN 1-56308-947-5 OCLC 57475961
12. Babbie, Earl R.. 2003. The Practice of Social Research (10th ed.). Wadsworth: Thomson Learning. ISBN 0-534-62029-9 OCLC 51917727
13. Collins, Randall. 1994. Four Sociological Traditions. Oxford: Oxford University Press. ISBN 0-19-508208-7 OCLC 28411490
14. Coser, Lewis A.. 1971. Masters of Sociological Thought: Ideas in Historical and Social Context. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich. ISBN 0-15-555128-0.
15. Giddens, Anthony. 2006. Sociology (5th ed.). Cambridge: Polity Press. ISBN 0-7456-3378-1 OCLC 63186308
16. Landis, Judson R (1989). Sociology: Concepts and Characteristics (7th ed.). Belmont, California: Wadsworth. ISBN 978-0-534-10158-9.

17. Lipset, Seymour Martin and Everett Carll Ladd. "The Politics of American Sociologists," *American Journal of Sociology* (1972) 78#1 pp. 67–104 JSTOR 2776571
18. Macionis, John J (1991). *Sociology* (3rd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall. ISBN 978-0-13-820358-0.
19. Merton, Robert K.. 1959. *Social Theory and Social Structure*. Toward the codification of theory and research (revised & enlarged ed.). Glencoe, IL. OCLC 4536864
20. Mills, C. Wright. 1959. *The Sociological Imagination* OCLC 165883
21. C. Wright Mills, Intellectual Craftsmanship Advices how to Work for young Sociologist
22. Mitchell, Geoffrey Duncan (2007) [1968]. *A Hundred Years of Sociology: A Concise History of the Major Figures, Ideas, and Schools of Sociological Thought*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers. ISBN 978-0-202-36168-0. OCLC 145146341.
23. Nisbet, Robert A. 1967. *The Sociological Tradition*, London, Heinemann Educational Books. ISBN 1-56000-667-6 OCLC 26934810
24. Ritzer, George, and Douglas J. Goodman. 2004. *Sociological Theory* (6th ed.). McGraw-Hill. ISBN 0-07-281718-6 OCLC 52240022
25. Scott, John, and Gordon Marshall, eds. 2005. *A Dictionary of Sociology* (3rd ed.). Oxford University Press. ISBN 0-19-860986-8, OCLC 60370982
26. Tausch, Arno (2014). *The political algebra of global value change. General models and implications for the Muslim world*. With Almas Heshmati and Hichem Karoui (1st ed.). Nova Science Publishers, New York. ISBN 978-1-62948-899-8.
27. Wallace, Ruth A., and Alison Wolf. 1995. *Contemporary Sociological Theory: Continuing the Classical Tradition* (4th ed.). Prentice-Hall. ISBN 0-13-036245-X OCLC 31604842
28. White, Harrison C.. 2008. *Identity and Control. How Social Formations Emerge* (2nd ed.). Princeton: Princeton University Press. ISBN 978-0-691-13714-8 OCLC 174138884
29. Willis, Evan. 1996. *The Sociological Quest: An introduction to the study of social life*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press. ISBN 0-8135-2367-2 OCLC 34633406
30. Rinfret, Sara; Scheberie, Denise; Pautz, Michelle (2014). "Chapter 2: The Policy Process and Policy Theories". *Public Policy: A Concise Introduction*. SAGE Publications. pp. 19–44. ISBN 9781506329710.
31. Nawarat, Nongyao; Medley, Michael (2014). "The Public Regime for Migrant Child Education in Thailand: Alternative Depictions of Policy". *Asian Politics and Policy*. 10 (3): 412–415. doi:10.1111/aspp.12408.
32. Easton, David (1953). *The political system: An enquiry into the state of political science*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf. p. 130.
33. Cairney, Paul (2012). *Understanding public policy: Theories and issues*. Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan. p. 5.

34. Titmuss, Richard (1974). Social Policy. London: George Allen & Unwin. p. 23. ISBN 0-394-49447-7 Check |isbn= value: checksum (help).
35. Lassance, Antonio (November 10, 2014). "What Is a Policy and What Is a Government Program? A Simple Question With No Clear Answer, Until Now". p. 7. SSRN 3727996.
36. Weiss, Carol H. (1972). Evaluation. London: Pearson. pp. 46–70. ISBN 978-0132921930.
37. Kathryn E. Newcomer; Harry P. Hatry; Joseph S. Wholey (2014). Handbook of Practical Program Evaluation. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley. pp. 62–88. ISBN 978-1-118-89360-9.
38. Dye, Thomas R. (1972). Understanding Public Policy. Upper Saddle, NJ: Prentice Hall. p. 2. ISBN 9780205716852.
39. Lassance, Antonio (November 10, 2014). "What Is a Policy and What Is a Government Program? A Simple Question With No Clear Answer, Until Now". p. 3. SSRN 3727996.
40. Dye, Thomas R. (1972). Understanding Public Policy. Upper Saddle, NJ: Prentice Hall. p. 13. ISBN 978-0136131472.
41. "Characteristics of Successful Public Policy". Norwich University Public Administration. Norwich University Public Administration. Retrieved 24 November 2014.